Design: Lorenzo Ottaviani Design / NY

# www.pict-pcti.org

Log on to our website for news about all international courts and tribunals (judgments. press releases, articles, and more). This chart can also be

downloaded from the PICT site

# EXISTING

The date in parenthesis indicates the year in which the body started operating. Note: this is not the date on which the agreement establishing the body was signed, nor necessarily the date of the agreement's entry into force.

## **EXTINCT**

The dates in parenthesis indicate the period during which the body was in operation.

## ABORTED

Certain bodies, after having had their constitutive instruments adopted, never started functioning. The date in parenthesis indicates the year in which the constitutive instrument was adopted.

## DORMANT

Certain bodies, while formally still operating have not received any submission for several years.

## NASCENT

The date in parenthesis indicates the year in which the constitutive instrument was adopted.

PROPOSED These are bodies whose establishment has been considered in the past by academics and law-makers, but which have

International Court of Justice (1946  $\rightarrow$ )

## EXTINCT

FXISTING

Permanent Court of International Justice (1922-1946)

**General Jurisdiction** 

International Judicial Bodies

# Law of the Sea

## EXISTING

International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea  $(1996 \rightarrow)$ 

# **Environment**

PROPOSED International Court for the Environment

# International Criminal Law/Humanitarian Law

## EXISTING

- International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (1993 →) International Criminal Tribunal
- for Rwanda (1995 →)
- International Criminal Court (2004)

## FXTINCT

- African Slave Trade Mixed Tribunals (1819-1866 circa) International Military Tribunal
- at Nuremberg (1945-1946) International Military Tribunal for the Far East (1946-1948)

International Prize Court (1907)

## ARORTED

**Human Rights and Humanitarian Law Bodies** 

# **Human Rights**

### EXISTING

 European Court of Human Rights (1959-1998 / 1998 →) • Inter-American Court of Human Rights (1979 →)

# NASCENT

 African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights (1998) The Protocol to the African (Baniul) Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights entered into force in January 25, 2004. However, by the time this synoptic chart was updated (November 2004), the ACHPR had not vet started operating.

## PROPOSED

 International Human Rights Court

## Trade, Commerce and Investments

### EXISTING

• World Trade Organization Dispute Settlement Understanding (1995 →) The DSU created a dispute settlement

### system based on a standing political organ (the Dispute Settlement Body). comprising all members of the WTO, a set of ad hoc expert panels, and the Appellate Body. The reports of the Panels and the Appellate Body can be rejected by the DSB only by consensus Strictly speaking, only the Appellate Body belongs in this column, while the DSB and the panels should be listed in the section "Permanent Arbitral

Tribunals/Conciliation Commissions"

### PROPOSED

• International Loans Tribunal

# **Regional Economic and Political Integration Agreements**

## Europe EXISTING

Court of Justice of the European Communities (1952 →) Benelux Economic Union Court

of Justice (1974  $\rightarrow$ ) The Benelux College of Arbitrators has been listed in the section "Permanent Arbitral Tribunals / Conciliation Commissions"

 Court of First Instance of the European Communities (1988 →) The European Court of Auditors (1977→) is not quite an internationa judicial body (see back). It is an internal control body of the European Union It examines whether EU budgetary

revenue has been received, and the

corresponding expenditure incurred

in a legal and regular manner. The

Court does not formally adjudicate

## to the Community bodies responsible in order that they may take appropriate action. EFTA Court (1994 →)

disputes (although it can render advisor)

of irregularities, including suspected

fraud, the information is communicated

 European Nuclear Energy Tribunal (OECD) (1957) • Western European Union

Tribunal (1957)

 European Tribunal on State Immunity (Council of Europe) (1972)

# Europe/Central Asia

## EXISTING

DORMANT

Economic Court of the Commonwealt of Independent States (1993 →)

# Africa/Middle East

## opinions). When auditors discover cases EXISTING Common Court of Justice and Arbitration of the Organization for the Harmonization of Corporate Law in Africa (1997 →)

- Court of Justice of the Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (1998 →)
- Court of Justice of the African Union (2003)
- Court of Justice of the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) (2001 →)
- Court of Justice of the West African Economic and Monetary Union (1996 →
- Court of Auditors of the West African Economic and Monetary Union (2000 →)
- East African Court of Justice (2001 →)

## FXTINCT

- East African Community Court of Appeal (1967-1977) East African Community Common
- Market Tribunal (1967-1977) Economic Community of West African States Tribunal (1975-1991)

## DORMANT

- Judicial Board of the Org. of Arab Petroleum Exporting Countries (1980)
- Court of Justice of the Economic Community of Central African States (1983)
- Court of Justice of the Arab Maghreb Union (1989)
- Court of Justice of the African Economic Community (1991)

NASCENT

PROPOSED

 International Islamic Court of Justice • Arab Court of Justice

### EXISTING

 Court of Justice of the Andean Community (1984 →)

 Central American Court of Justice "Corte Centroamericana de Justicia" (1994 →)

 Central American Court of Justice "Corte de Justicia Centroamericana" (1908-18)

Central American Tribunal (1923)

# NASCENT

• MERCOSUR Court of Justice · Inter-American Court of Intl. Justice

## Southern Africa Development Community Tribunal (2000)

# International Claims and Compensation Bodies - Multilateral / Bilateral

- Iran-United States Claims Tribunal (1980 →)
- Marshall Islands Nuclear Claims Tribunal (1983 →)
- United Nations Compensation Commission (1991 →)
- Dormant Accounts in Switzerland
- Compensation Programme (2000 →
- Eritrea-Ethiopia Claims

Commission (2000 →

## EXTINCT

- American-Mexican Claims Commissions (1868, 1923 and 1924)
- Conciliation Commissions under the 1947 Peace Treaty with Italy (1947-1965\*)
- UN Tribunal for Eritrea (1951-1954)
- UN Tribunal for Libya (1951-1955) Commission for Real Property

Herzegovina) (1995-2003)

## Arbitral Tribunal and Mixed Commission under the 1953 Londor

- Arbitral Commission on Property.
- Rights, and Interests in Germany (1956-1969)
  - award was made

Internationalized Criminal Courts and Tribunals

Latin America / Caribbean

## EXTINCT

• Caribbean Court of Justice (2001)

# PROPOSED

# Ouasi-Judicial, Implementation Control and other Dispute Settlement Bodies

- EXISTING ILO Commission of Inquiry (1919 →)
- ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations (1926 →)
- ILO Conference Committee on the Application of Conventions (1926 →)
- United Nations Commission on Human Rights (1946 →) ILO Governing Body Committee on
- Freedom of Association (1950 →) Committee of Independent Experts under the European Social Charter (1965 →) Renamed in 1998 European
- Committee of Social Rights Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (1969 →)
- International Civil and Political Rights Committee (1976 →) Inter-American Commission on Human Rights (1979 →)
- Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (1981 →)
- Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1987 →)
- Committee Against Torture (1987 →) African Commission on Human
- and Peoples' Rights (1987 →) European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment  $(1989 \rightarrow)$
- Committee on the Rights of the Child (1990 →)
- European Commission Against Racism and Intolerance (1993 →)

- Commission for Displaced Persons and Refugees (Bosnia Herzegovina) (1995 →)
- Commission to Preserve National Monuments (Bosnia Herzegovina) (1995 →)
- · Committee on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families  $(2004 \rightarrow)$

International Humanitarian Fact

Finding Commission (1992 →)

- EXTINCT European Commission
- on Human Rights (1959-1998) Human Rights Chamber for Bosnia and Herzegovina (1996-2003)
- Human Rights Commission Within the Constitutional Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina (2004-2005)

# International Administrative Tribunals

- International Labour Organization Administrative Tribunal (1946 →)
- United Nations Administrative Tribunal (1949 →) Appeal Board of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and
- Development (1950 →) Appeals Board of the Western
- European Union (1956 →) Council of Europe Appeals Board
- Appeals Board of NATO (1965 →) Appeals Board of the Intergovernmental Committee
- for Migration (1972 →) Appeals Board of the European Space Agency (1975 →) Administrative Tribunal of the
- Organization of American States (1976 →) World Bank Administrative Tribunal (1980 →)

- Inter-American Development Bank Administrative Tribunal (1981 →)
- International Monetary Fund Administrative Tribunal (1994 →)
- Asian Development Bank Administrative Tribunal African Development Bank
- Administrative Tribunal Latin American Integration Association Administrative Tribunal

- EXTINCT League of Nations Administrative Tribunal (1927-1945)
- Appeals Board of the European Space Research Organization (1966-1974) Appeals Board of the European Space Vehicle Launcher

Development Organization

## EXISTING

 World Bank Inspection Panel (1994 →)

**Inspection Panels** 

- Inter-American Development Bank Independent Investigation Mechanism (1995 →)
- Asian Development Bank Inspection Policy (1995 →)

- Claims Resolution Tribunal for
- German Forced Labour

- Claims of Displaced Persons and Refugees (Bosnia and

## · Property Commissions under the Peace Treaty with Japan (1951-1961\*)

- Agreement on German External Debts (1953-1980\*)
- Austro-German Property Arbitral Tribunal (1961-1973)

Special Court for Sierra Leone

"Regulation 64" Panels in the

Courts of Kosovo (2000 →)

### This list is not exhaustive. but only illustrative. There are more than 80 mixed arbitral tribunals and claims commissions that were created in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries in the wake of armed conflicts and revolutions. Most of them were created in the

aftermath of World Wars I and II This is the date in which the last

# Permanent Arbitral Tribunals/Conciliation Commissions

- EXISTING Permanent Court of Arbitration  $(1899 \rightarrow)$ International Joint Commission
- $(1909 \rightarrow)$  Bank for International Settlements Arbitral Tribunal (1930 -

Organization Council (under the

1944 Chicago Convention the ICAO Council has certain dispute settlement competences) (1944 → International Centre for the Settlement of Investment

International Civil Aviation

Disputes (1966 →) Gulf Cooperation Council Commission for the Settlement of Disputes (1981 →)

• Court of Arbitration for Sport

North American Commission on Environmental Cooperation (1993-

## EXISTING NAFTA Dispute Settl. Panels (1994 →

of the World Intellectual Property Organization (1994 →) EXTINCT Upper Silesia Arbitral Tribunal

Arbitration and Mediation Center

(1922-1937) OAU Commission of Mediation. Conciliation and Arbitration

# (1964-1999)

- Arbitral Tribunal of the Inter-governmental Organization for International
- Economic Union (1958) Court of Arbitration of the French
- Arbitration Tribunal of the Central American Common Market (1960)

### Serious Crimes Panels in the District Court of Dili (East Timor) (2000 →)

EXISTING

 $(2003 \rightarrow)$ 

NASCENT Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (2003)

# PROPOSED

Special War Crimes Chamber for

The so-called Lockerbie Trial Court was not an international body nor an internationalized one. It was a Scottish court, applying Scottish criminal law. Unlike the bodies listed in this column. it did not carry out its functions under international supervision.

Truth and reconciliation commissions (like the ones created for South Africa, Guatemala, Argentina, etc.) are not listed in this chart because. although of international interest, they are essentially domestic endeavours.

The Iragi Special Tribunal (2004 →) is not listed here as it is neither a

# Non-Compliance / Implementation Monitoring Bodies (Environmental Agreements)

# EXISTING

Implementation Committee under the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Laver (1990 →) • IMO Sub-committee on Flag

State Implementation (1992 →)

Implementation Committee

of the Protocols to the 1979

ECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (1997 →) Committee for the Review of the Implementation of the Desertification Convention (2002 →

# EXISTING

(2005 →)

(1966-1974)

- Basel Convention on Control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and their Dispos Compliance Committee (2003 →)
- Aarhus Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters Compliance Committee (2003 →) Compliance Committee of the

Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety

# NASCENT

- - Multilateral Consultative Process for the United Nations Climate

Organic Pollutants (2001)

# Kvoto Protocol Compliance System

- Rotterdam Convention on the Prior Informed Consent Procedure for Certain Hazardous Chemicals and Pesticides in International Trade
- Change Convention (1998) Stockholm Convention on Persistent
- (1984 →)

# DORMANT

- Carriage by Rail (OTIF) (1890) Arbitral College of the Benelux
- Community (1959)
- OSCE Court of Conciliation and Arbitration (1994)

# Bosnia-Herzegovina

fully international nor an internationalized criminal body. It is an Iraqi tribunal, composed of Iraqi judges, and applying Iraqi law. Be that as it may, under the IST Statute, non-Iraqi nationals may (and in practice do) assist or observe the work of the Special Tribunal.

## Version 3.0 (November 2004

not yet become reality.



# The International Judiciary in Context: A Synoptic Chart

The purpose of this chart is to provide international legal scholars and practitioners with a compendium of all international judicial bodies. Yet, this apparently straightforward task is riddled with traps and dilemmas. Perhaps the greatest challenge is to portray what can be called oxymoronically "an anarchic system" without exaggerating its level of order. The grouping and sub-grouping of all these bodies and mechanisms into a taxonomy does not imply the existence of an "international judicial system", if by system it is meant "a regularly interacting or interdependent group of items forming a unified whole" or "a functionally related group of elements" (Webster's Collegiate Dictionary, 10th ed.). Whether they ought to exist as a system is open to debate.

The second challenge is that in order to capture the dynamism and fluidity of the international judicial domain, any chart of the international judiciary needs to have a temporal dimension. Thus, alongside existing institutions, such as the International Court of Justice, the chart portrays bodies that have been closed down (labeled "extinct"), such as the Permanent Court of International Justice. There are also bodies provided for in treaties that never entered into force (aborted), such as the International Prize Court; idle ones like the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe's European Nuclear Energy Tribunal (dormant); and nascent bodies, like the International Criminal Court. Moreover, the synoptic chart also includes bodies that have been debated and remain confined to the realm of ideas, such as a possible International Court for the Environment (proposed). In sum, the chart depicts the past, present and potential make-up of the international judiciary.

The main focus of the chart is on international judicial bodies. On the top portion of the chart, there are 43 different institutions (of which only 16 are currently functioning) grouped by subject-matter jurisdiction in seven clusters. All the entities listed in this group meet certain fundamental criteria, which set them apart from all other entities listed in the bottom part of the chart. Namely, these entities:

- a) are permanent institutions;
- b) are composed of independent judges;
- adjudicate disputes between two or more entities, at least one of which is either a State or an International Organization;
- d) work on the basis of predetermined rules of procedure; and
- e) render decisions that are binding.

Altogether, these entities form the so-called "international judiciary". However, in order to fully understand the reasons for the rapid quantitative increase in the number of international judicial bodies, the extensive transformation of their competencies, and the success of certain subject-matter jurisdictions over others, it is necessary to include also those bodies and mechanisms which, while not meeting several or all of the above mentioned standards, also play a role in the enforcement, interpretation and implementation of international law. When these international judicial bodies are placed in a much larger historical and analytical context, 82 other entities and mechanisms, referred to as "Quasi-Judicial, Implementation Control and other Dispute Settlement Bodies", and gathered in seven autonomous clusters, need to be accounted for (excluding extinct International Claims and Compensation Bodies).

The institutions and mechanisms listed in this chart have very few legal or functional links among one another, either within or across each major grouping or cluster. Admittedly, until 1995 the International Court of Justice could review judgments of the United Nations Administrative Tribunal, but the link was then severed by the UN General Assembly. Certain institutions listed in the group "human rights bodies" (e.g., the Inter-American Commission on Human

Rights) act as a mandatory filter for certain international courts and tribunals (in this case the Inter-American Court of Human Rights). Again, there are several cases of potentially competing "jurisdictions", both among bodies within the same group (e.g., the International Court of Justice and the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea) and bodies in different groups (e.g., the non-compliance procedures, the International Court of Justice or the World Trade Organization Dispute Settlement Body, to cite but a few). However, beyond such links, each institution is formally unrelated to any other.

Nonetheless, in their staggering diversity these 125 international bodies and mechanisms have certain commonalties that justify their presence on the same layout. First, all of these entities make legal determinations, and this sets them apart from other bodies, such as the UN General Assembly or the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, which share the same aspiration towards a "just world" but are of a quintessentially political nature. To be precise, these 125 bodies determine whether certain acts are congruous with certain norms. And this leads to a second commonality, which is the fact that in order to make their determinations they all resort to the same body of law: international law. Third, all of these international bodies have been established directly or indirectly (i.e., through a decision taken by a body established by treaty) by international agreements. It follows that they are subject to a legal order that is different from that of national systems, but, at the same time, that they are subject to (and materially dependent on) State support. Finally, and perhaps more importantly, collectively they are the expression of a widely shared need to abandon a world where only States count and the mighty rule, in favor of an order where certain fundamental common values are shared, protected and enforced by all members of a wide society, composed of States, International Organizations and individuals in all their legal incarnations (NGOs, peoples, corporations, natural persons, etc.).

Like any chart, this one is most likely incomplete. It is the result of an ongoing research effort carried out within PICT, and should be considered at best a partial representation of what exists, or has existed. Certain groupings have a mere illustrative function, for the enormous number of bodies that have been created in the past could not properly fit in the scheme. Other entries might change status in the near future, and new institutions and mechanisms might be created. Therefore, this chart will be updated regularly. To this end, any comments and suggestions will be greatly appreciated and can be sent to <cr28@acf2.nyu.edu>.

Cesare P.R. Romano

## Note to Version 2.0

This is an updated version of the Synoptic Chart that was prepared in 1998 as a supplement to the special issue of the NYU Journal of International Law and Politics, Vol. 31, 4. That version listed 41 bodies in the top group and 55 in the bottom one. Some of the additions are new bodies that have been created or proposed since 1998, while others are simply past omissions that have been kindly pointed out by readers.

New features of this chart include a special category for "dormant bodies" and a new sub-grouping in the bottom part called "Internationalized Criminal Courts and Tribunals" (i.e., domestic criminal tribunals with international supervision created in the aftermath of regional and domestic armed conflicts, such as those for Sierra Leone, Kosovo, East Timor, and Cambodia). These are the latest additions to the multitude of bodies populating the international legal scene.

## Note to Version 3.0

This is an update to Version 2.0 of the Synoptic Chart, prepared in August 2001. We added six new bodies to the top section (International Judicial Bodies), while three bodies changed status, and a few corrections were made. For what concerns the bottom part (Quasi-Judicial, Implementation Control and Dispute Settlement Bodies), we added five bodies, changed the status of nine, and made a few corrections needed. As compared to the previous version, most changes occurred in the "Regional Economic and Political Integration Agreements" section, in particular under the tab "Africa", where a series of bodies previously not listed where added, and, in the bottom part, in the "Non-Compliance" section, where several bodies and procedures changed status."